

VERMONT LEGISLATIVE

Joint Fiscal Office

1 Baldwin Street • Montpelier, VT 05633-5701 • (802) 828-2295 • https://ljfo.vermont.gov

Fiscal Note

May 8, 2023

Chris Rupe and Ted Barnett

H.53 – An act relating to driver's license suspensions

<u>Senate proposal of amendment</u>¹ to <u>House proposal of amendment</u>² to <u>Senate proposal</u> of amendment³

Bill Summary

his bill proposes to eliminate the suspension of a driver's license or privilege to operate⁴ based on the nonpayment of amounts due for traffic violations for which the imposition of points is authorized by law ("moving violations").

This bill also changes both the amount and allocation of civil marriage license fees. The cost of a marriage license would increase from \$60 to \$80. Town clerks would retain \$15 of the fee, \$15 would get deposited in the General Fund, and \$50 would go to the Domestic and Sexual Violence Special Fund.

H.53 is expected to reduce Transportation Fund revenues by approximately \$200,000 annually and increase Special Fund revenues by \$72,000 in fiscal years 2024 and 2025

Fiscal Impact

JFO estimates that the bill would have a fiscal impact of approximately \$200,000 in foregone annual revenue to the Transportation Fund due to fewer license reinstatement fees. Court-related special funds may also see revenue impacts if H.53 alters individual behavior with respect to payment plan participation and timely payment of amounts due.

The civil marriage license fee change in fiscal years 2024 and 2025 in the bill would increase Special Fund revenues allocated to the Domestic and Sexual Violence Special Fund. Based on the estimated 4,800 civil marriage licenses issued per year, JFO estimates the additional \$15 allocated to the Domestic and Sexual Violence Special Fund would result in a \$72,000 increase in Special Fund revenue in fiscal years 2024 and 2025. In addition:

https://legislature.vermont.gov/Documents/2024/Docs/BILLS/H-0053/H-00528/2028

 $[\]frac{0053\%20 Senate\%20 proposal\%20 of\%20 amendment\%20 to\%20 House\%20 proposal\%20 of\%20 amendment\%20 to\%20 Senate\%20 proposal\%20 of\%20 amendment\%20 Official.pdf$

 $[\]frac{^2\text{https://legislature.vermont.gov/Documents/2024/WorkGroups/House\%20Ways\%20and\%20Means/Bills/H.53/W\sim Anthea\%20Dexter-Cooper\sim H.53\%20Dolan\%20and\%20Kornheiser\%20Amendment\sim 4-25-2023.pdf$

³https://legislature.vermont.gov/Documents/2024/Docs/BILLS/H-0053/H-

^{0053%20}Senate%20proposal%20of%20amendment%20Official.pdf

 $H.53 \ As \ Passed \ by \ the \ House: \underline{https://legislature.vermont.gov/Documents/2024/Docs/BILLS/H-0053/H-0053\%20As\%20passed\%20by\%20the\%20House\%20Official.pdf}$

⁴ A "driver's license" is compliant with the REAL ID Act of 2005 and available to U.S. citizens or legally present foreign nationals. A "privilege card" is available to Vermont residents without requiring proof of U.S. citizenship or legal presence. For simplicity, this Fiscal Note will refer to both as "licenses."



- Town clerks would be able to retain an additional \$5 of the civil marriage license fee, for a total of \$15 retained.
- The General Fund allocation of marriage licenses would not change, so this bill does not have a General Fund impact.

Table 1 shows the estimated revenue impact of these changes based on an estimated 4,800 civil marriage licenses issued per year.

Table 1: Summary of Civil Marriage License Fee Changes

	Current Law Fee Allocation	As Proposed Fee Allocation	Revenue Change
Domestic and Sexual Violence Special Fund	\$35	\$50	\$72,000
Town Clerks	\$10	\$15	\$24,000*
General Fund	\$15	\$15	\$0
Total	\$60	\$80	\$96,000

^{*}This is an aggregated estimate of revenues that would be received by Town Clerks statewide

Background and Details on Driver's License Suspensions

Under current law, an individual is allowed 30 days to pay the amount due from a traffic violation for which the imposition of points against the person's driving record is authorized by law (frequently called a "moving violation"). The "amount due" consists of all financial assessments contained in a Judicial Bureau judgment, including penalties, fines, surcharges, court costs, and any other assessments authorized by law. Failure to pay the amount due by the 30-day deadline results in a license suspension for 30 days or until the amount due is satisfied (whichever is earlier). Additionally, the Judicial Bureau issues a \$30 fee for failure to pay within 30 days, which is added to the amount due and deposited in the Court Technology Special Fund when paid. Statute also authorizes an \$80 fee to reinstate a suspended or revoked driver's license, though this fee may be reduced or waived by a hearing officer. Revenue from this fee is directed to the Transportation Fund.

Current law requires the Judicial Bureau to offer payment plans to individuals to avoid suspension from failure to pay the amount due. These payment plans shall not require payments of more than \$30 per traffic violation judgment per month, not to exceed \$100 per month if the individual has four or more outstanding judgments. H.53 maintains this provision but clarifies that payment plans shall be made available for all individuals, as other elements of H.53 propose to eliminate the possibility of suspensions solely for failure to pay amounts due. This clarification is not expected to significantly change existing Judicial Bureau payment plan practices.

Act 147 (2016) previously eliminated the suspension of a license for failure to pay amounts due for *non-moving* traffic violations for which *no* points are authorized. H.53 proposes to eliminate the suspension of a driver's license on the basis of an individual failing to pay a judgment on a traffic violation for which the imposition of points *is* authorized. The Judicial Bureau may engage collection agencies, offset State tax refunds (assuming the individual is entitled to a Vermont tax refund), or initiate civil contempt proceedings to recover the amount due if a defendant fails to pay after 75 days and is not currently complying with a payment plan (though civil

⁵ 23 V.S.A. § 4(44).

^{6 4} V.S.A. §1109

⁷ 23 V.S.A. §675. Note that a person who fails to respond to a violation within 21 days may also be subject to a \$20 failure to answer fee, which accrues to the Court Technology Special Fund per 4 V.S.A. §1105.

⁸ For a full list of traffic violations and their associated points, see https://dmv.vermont.gov/enforcement-and-safety/violation-codes/vermont-violation-codes



contempt proceedings are rarely pursued).

As passed by the Senate, H.53 would take effect 30 calendar days after passage. Upon the effective date, driver's licenses can no longer be prospectively suspended solely for the nonpayment of amounts due from traffic violations for which points are authorized. License suspensions would continue to be permitted for behavioral offenses (e.g., accumulating 10 or more points, driving while under the influence). H.53 does not explicitly address any pre-existing license suspensions due to nonpayment of amounts due that are already in effect at the time of passage, but current law caps the duration of those suspensions to 30 days. Once the 30-day period elapses, a license can then be restored upon successful application, payment of the reinstatement fee, and compliance with any other conditions imposed.

Fiscal Impact

Table 2 shows how revenue from traffic violations on state highways, including those for which points are authorized, are allocated:⁹

Table 2: Allocation of State Traffic Violation Revenues by Fund				
Penalties and Surcharges	Fund Receiving Revenue			
Amount of Civil Traffic Penalty	Transportation Fund			
Judicial Bureau Surcharge	Crime Victims' Restitution Special Fund			
(15% of civil penalty amount)				
Judicial Bureau Surcharge (\$47 per violation):				
\$29.75	Victims Compensation Special Fund			
\$10.00	Domestic Violence & Sexual Violence Special Fund			
\$7.25	General Fund			
Court Technology Fee (\$12.50 per violation)	Court Technology Special Fund			
Judicial Bureau Late Payment Fee (\$30)	Court Technology Special Fund			
Judicial Bureau Failure to Answer Fee (\$20)	Court Technology Special Fund			
DMV License Reinstatement Fee (\$80)	Transportation Fund			

No provisions of H.53 explicitly modify existing financial penalties or surcharges for committing specific traffic violations. However, the bill may impact State revenues in several ways:

• Fewer license reinstatement fees will cost the Transportation Fund approximately \$200,000 of annual revenue. Statute calls for an \$80 reinstatement fee to be paid to the Department of Motor Vehicles (D.M.V.) to restore a suspended or revoked license. Revenue from this fee is deposited into the Transportation Fund (which receives approximately \$300 million annually from all State tax and fee sources). The reinstatement fee may be waived or reduced by a hearing officer on the basis of a defendant's driving history, ability to pay, service to the community, collateral consequences of the violation, or the interests of justice. H.53 proposes no changes to these provisions but would result in fewer license suspensions and therefore fewer reinstatement fees paid.

According to the D.M.V., 3,999 unique individual licenses were suspended during calendar year 2022 for nonpayment of amounts due for traffic moving violations – 43 percent of the total unique license suspensions imposed.¹²

Due to data limitations and known variables, it is not possible to precisely predict the fiscal impact of this legislation from year to year. There is not a perfect correlation between the number of license suspensions and reinstatements because an individual may have multiple suspensions imposed against them for

⁹ Funds from certain moving violations enforced by towns within the jurisdiction of the town are remitted to the town by formula, per <u>13 V.S.A. § 7251</u>.

¹⁰ 23 V.S.A. § 675

¹¹ 4 V.S.A. § 1109(4)(B)

¹² Per DMV testimony to the House Judiciary Committee, January 27, 2023 and February 7, 2023: https://legislature.vermont.gov/Documents/2024/WorkGroups/House%20Judiciary/Bills/H.53/Witness%20Testimony/H.53~Michael%20Smith~Summary%20of%202016-2022%20Suspensions~1-27-2023.pdf



multiple unpaid violations yet pay one reinstatement fee to restore their license. Additionally, not all suspended licenses are promptly reinstated and hearing officers have the discretion to reduce or waive the reinstatement fee, so it cannot be assumed that all individuals apply to have their license restored or pay the full \$80 reinstatement fee. An individual may also have a license suspended for both nonpayment of traffic violations and other issues that would not be impacted by H.53. Additionally, data on suspensions is tracked on a calendar year basis while revenues collected are tracked on a fiscal year basis. While an informed estimate can be generated, it should be considered preliminary and subject to yearly fluctuation due to these factors.

Regardless of the number of suspensions involved, the individual is responsible for paying one reinstatement fee to restore their license. Estimates, therefore, must be based on assumptions about the number of *unique individual license suspensions* that would be restored rather than solely on the *total number of suspensions imposed*. Focusing on unique individual suspensions, H.53 could result in approximately \$200,000 of foregone Transportation Fund revenue annually if no more licenses were suspended due to nonpayment of amounts due for traffic moving violations. Actual fiscal impacts are expected to vary from year to year for the reasons stated above. To highlight the range of possible annual variability, from FY 2021 to FY 2022, actual reinstatement fee revenue collected from all types of suspensions fluctuated from \$532,000 to \$424,000 (respectively) and averaged \$478,000. Absent more precise data, it is reasonable to assume that approximately 43 percent of this reinstatement fee revenue (approximately \$200,000 annually) would no longer be owed or collected in future years under H.53.

- Processing fewer license suspensions and reinstatements is expected to result in insignificant impacts to administrative costs. According to D.M.V. testimony to the House Judiciary Committee (January 27, 2023), since most of the underlying data exchange processes are automated, the impact of H.53 on the workload of D.M.V. staff is expected to be negligible. The department expects to avoid minimal costs related to generating and mailing suspension letters. The Judicial Bureau reported that H.53 would not have a significant impact on its workload but may lead to minor postage savings and a minor cost associated with printing new tickets with updated information (approximately \$8,000 \$9,000 for an order of 60,000 tickets). The Judicial Bureau may also face some relatively minor one-time computer system configuration costs to modify its data exchange process with D.M.V.
- H.53 could impact collections to the court-related special funds if it induces behavior to change. Removing the threat of a license suspension for failure to pay amounts due within 30 days could reduce voluntary compliance rates for making prompt payments. However, a policy argument can be made that suspending driver's licenses over failure to pay may be counterproductive if it hinders an individual's ability to maintain employment and earn the wages necessary to pay what they owe.

According to previous testimony from the Judicial Bureau, collection rates decreased following Act 147's passage. As of May 2019, there was nearly \$1 million of foregone annual revenue from outstanding nopoint violations, \$700,000 from point moving violations, and \$245,000 from failure to answer and failure to pay fees. Over time, accounts receivables have increased, indicating a lengthening of the period for amounts due to be paid. The Judicial Bureau reported that tax offsets have substantially increased to recover a growing balance of delinquent payments. ¹³

Any behavioral changes that lead to an increase in payment plan participation or collections activity may impact the timing of revenue collections and could also lead to a greater volume of Failure to Pay fees owed to the Court Technology Special Fund. While tax offsets can effectively recover delinquent amounts

https://legislature.vermont.gov/Documents/2020/WorkGroups/House%20Judiciary/Bills/H.578/Written%20Testimony/H. 578~Gregg%20Mousley~Collection%20Efforts%20Civil%20Violations%202020~1-22-2020.pdf

¹³ Updated data for more recent years was unavailable at the time of publication. Testimony of Gregg Mousley, Judicial Bureau, to the House Judiciary Committee, January 22, 2020.



due, the individual must have a Vermont tax refund owed to them to offset.

While this Fiscal Note does not attempt to predict if future behavior may (or may not) change in response to H.53, these issues are flagged as potential risks in light of the collections trends previously reported by the Judicial Bureau.

The actual fiscal impacts of H.53 through the factors noted above depend on several unknown variables:

- Volume of moving violation issuance
- Future compliance rates with the current 30-day payment period
- Future participation rates in payment plans
- Duration of payment plans, which will be influenced by the balances of the amounts due
- Judicial Bureau-initiated collection agency actions, tax offsets, and other enforcement efforts

• Civil Marriage License Fees and Special Fund revenue to the Domestic and Sexual Violence Special Fund would increase.

The Domestic and Sexual Violence Special Fund receives funding from two sources: \$10 from the \$47 fee added onto criminal and civil judgements (including moving violations), and civil marriage license fees. Between the two revenue sources, the Domestic and Sexual Violence Special Fund has seen declining revenues since fiscal year 2017, with revenues in fiscal year 2022 only 57 percent of revenues in fiscal year 2017, as shown in Table 3.

Table 3: Domestic and Sexual Violence Special Fund Revenues¹⁴

	Revenue	Change from prior year	Percent change
FY 2017	\$939,833		
FY 2018	\$901,087	(\$38,746)	-4.12%
FY 2019	\$846,618	(\$54,469)	-6.04%
FY 2020	\$761,959	(\$84,659)	-10.00%
FY 2021	\$530,292	(\$231,667)	-30.40%
FY 2022	\$534,739	\$4,447	0.84%

However, outside of a one-year decrease in the number of marriages licenses caused by the pandemic, revenues from marriage license fees have been relatively constant. Table 4 shows the revenue from the \$35 share of civil marriage license fees for fiscal years 2017 through 2022.

Table 4: Domestic and Sexual Violence Special Fund Revenues from Civil Marriage License Fees

	FY 2017	FY 2018	FY 2019	FY 2020	FY 2021	FY 2022
Revenue from civil						
marriage license fees	\$156,963	\$183,270	\$166,711	\$167,355	\$122,225	\$182,210
Number of marriage	4,485	5,236	4,763	4.782	3,492	5,206
licenses	4,403	3,230	4,703	4,702	3,492	3,200

The overall decrease in revenues has put pressure on the finances on the Domestic and Sexual Violence Special Fund. As shown in Table 5, revenues outpaced expenses in fiscal years 2020 and 2021, which resulted in a fund deficit of \$133,312 at the end of fiscal year 2021. In fiscal year 2022, revenues were slightly ahead of expenditures and the fund received an appropriation of \$250,000 in the 2022 budget adjustment act (Act 83 of 2022)¹⁵ to bring it to a positive balance again.

¹⁴ The Department of Finance and Management VISION financial system provided information for Tables 3, 4, and 5.

 $^{^{15}\} https://legislature.vermont.gov/Documents/2022/Docs/ACTS/ACT083/ACT083\%20As\%20Enacted.pdf$

Table 5: Domestic and Sexual Violence Fund Balance¹⁴

	FY 2019	FY 2020	FY 2021	FY 2022
Carryforward	\$129,322	\$123,598	\$68,925	\$(133,312)
Revenue	\$846,617	\$761,958	\$530,292	\$534,739
Expenses	\$852,341	\$816,631	\$732,531	\$520,926
Other sources				\$250,000
Fund Balance	123,598	\$68,925	\$(133,312)	\$130,500

The estimate of civil marriage license fee revenue is based on the average number of licenses issued per year (4,800) between fiscal years 2017 and 2022, except for the outlier in fiscal year 2021 caused by the COVID-19 pandemic. H.53 would increase the portion of civil marriage license fees allocated to the Domestic and Sexual Violence Special Fund by \$15, which would increase estimated revenues to the fund by \$72,000. In total, the Domestic and Sexual Violence Special Fund would receive an estimated \$240,000 annually.

¹⁴ https://lifo.vermont.gov/assets/Meetings/Joint-Fiscal-Committee/2022-11-09/a8d3823012/Special-Fund-Report-FY2022.pdf